

(Stipulating Parties Listed on Signature Pages)

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO

**In re: CATHODE RAY TUBE (CRT)  
ANTITRUST LITIGATION**

Case No. 07-5944 SC

MDL No. 1917

This Document Relates to:

*Electrograph Systems, Inc., et al. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al.*, No. 11-cv-01656;

*Stoebner, et al. v. LG Electronics, et al.*, No. 11-cv-05381;

*Siegel v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al.*, No. 11-cv-05502;

*Best Buy Co., Inc., et al. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al.*, No. 11-cv-05513;

*Target Corp, et al. v. Chunghwa Picture Tubes, Ltd., et al.*, No. 11-cv-05514;

*Interbond Corporation of America v. Hitachi, et al.*, No. 11-cv-06275;

*Office Depot, Inc. v. Hitachi Ltd., et al.*, No. 11-cv-06276;

*CompuCom Systems, Inc. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al.*, No. 11-cv-06396;

*Costco Wholesale Corporation v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al.*, No. 11-cv-06397;

*P.C. Richard & Son Long Island Corporation, et al., v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al.*, No. 12-cv-02648;

*Schultze Agency Services, LLC, et al. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al.*, No. 12-cv-02649;

*Tech Data Corp. v. Hitachi, Ltd*, No. 13-cv-00157.

**STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED]  
ORDER OF DISMISSAL OF  
DEFENDANTS SAMSUNG  
ELECTRONICS COMPANY, LTD.  
AND SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS  
AMERICA, INC.**

1 WHEREAS, there is pending in the United States District Court for the Northern District  
 2 of California a multidistrict consolidated proceeding comprised of actions brought on behalf of  
 3 purported purchasers of cathode ray tube ("CRT") products, captioned as *In re: Cathode Ray*  
 4 *Tube (CRT) Antitrust Litigation*, Case No 3:07-cv-05944 SC (MDL No 1917) (the "MDL  
 5 Proceedings"); and

6 WHEREAS, Direct Action Plaintiffs ("DAPs") filed complaints<sup>1</sup> ("Complaints"), that list  
 7 Samsung Electronics Company, Ltd. ("SEC") and Samsung Electronics America, Inc. ("SEAI")  
 8 among the defendants; and

9 WHEREAS, the Complaints assert certain claims under federal and various states' laws  
 10 against SEC and SEAI based on an alleged conspiracy to fix the prices of CRTs from March 1,  
 11 1995 to November 25, 2007 ("DAPs' CRT Claims");

12 WHEREAS, Special Master Charles A. Legge recommended that the Complaints against  
 13 SEC and SEAI be dismissed with leave to amend on May 2, 2013 ("Report and  
 14 Recommendations") [Dkt. No. 1664]; and

15 WHEREAS, DAPs have agreed to dismiss SEC and SEAI from their Complaints without  
 16 prejudice under certain conditions set forth in a separately executed tolling agreement;

17 NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by and among the  
 18 undersigned counsel, on behalf of their respective clients, as follows:

19 1. DAPs voluntarily dismiss all of the DAPs' CRT Claims against SEC and SEAI,

20 <sup>1</sup> Specifically, this Stipulation relates to the following complaints: *Tech Data Corp. v. Hitachi,*  
 21 *Ltd.*, No. 13-cv-00157 (N.D. Cal.) [Dkt. No. 1] (Dec. 11, 2012) ("Tech Data Compl."); *Stoebner v.*  
 22 *LG Electronics, Inc.*, No. 11-cv-05381 (N.D. Cal.) [Dkt. No. 1] (Nov. 7, 2011) ("Polaroid  
 23 *Compl.*"); *Target Corp. v. Chunghwa Picture Tubes, Ltd.*, No. 11-cv-05514 (N.D. Cal.) [Dkt. No.  
 24 9] (Jan. 6, 2012) ("Target Am. Compl."); *P.C. Richard & Son Long Island Corp. v. Hitachi, Ltd.*,  
 25 No. 12-cv-02648 (N.D. Cal.) [Dkt. No. 1] (Nov. 14, 2011) ("P.C. Richard Compl."); *Schultze*  
 26 *Agency Servs., LLC v. Hitachi, Ltd.*, No. 12-cv-02649 (N.D. Cal.) [Dkt. No. 1] (Nov. 14, 2011)  
 27 ("Tweeter Compl."); *CompuCom Systems, Inc. v. Hitachi, Ltd.*, No. 11-cv-06396 (N.D. Cal.)  
 28 [Dkt. No. 1] (Nov. 14, 2011) ("CompuCom Compl."); *Interbond Corp. of Am. v. Hitachi, Ltd.*,  
 No. 11-cv-06275 (N.D. Cal.) [Dkt. No. 1] (Nov. 14, 2011) ("Interbond Compl."); *Costco*  
*Wholesale Corp. v. Hitachi, Ltd.*, No. 11-cv-06397 (N.D. Cal.) [Dkt. No. 1] (Nov. 14, 2011)  
 ("Costco Compl."); *Siegel v. Hitachi, Ltd.*, No. 11-cv-05502 (N.D. Cal.) [Dkt. No. 1] (Nov. 14,  
 2011) ("Circuit City Compl."); *Office Depot, Inc. v. Hitachi, Ltd.*, No. 11-cv-06276 (N.D. Cal.)  
 [Dkt. No. 1] (Nov. 14, 2011) ("Office Depot Compl."); *Best Buy Co., Inc. v. Hitachi, Ltd.*, No.  
 11-cv-05513 (N.D. Cal.) [Dkt. No. 1] (Nov. 14, 2011) ("Best Buy Compl."); and *Electrograph*  
*Systems, Inc. v. Hitachi, Ltd.*, No. 11-cv-01656 (N.D. Cal.) [Dkt. No. 5] (Mar. 10, 2011)  
 ("Electrograph Am. Compl.).

1 without prejudice, pursuant to Rule 41(a)(1)(A)(ii) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

2       2. Each party shall bear their own costs and attorney fees, and the parties shall not  
3 pursue any sanctions against each other or their counsel so long as the DAP CRT Claims remain  
4 dismissed.

5       3. This Stipulation does not alter in any way the separately executed, written tolling  
6 agreement between DAPs and Defendants SEC and SEAI.

7       4. This stipulation does not affect the rights or claims of DAPs against any other  
8 defendant or alleged co-conspirator in this litigation.

9       5. SEC and SEAI acknowledge and agree that DAPs may serve discovery on them  
10 pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, and 34 rather than Fed. R. Civ. P. 45; SEC and SEAI  
11 further agree that if they produce discovery to any party in the action, they will produce that  
12 discovery to DAPs; the Parties will meet and confer in good faith in an attempt to narrow any  
13 future discovery and minimize burdens.

14       6. SEC and SEAI will not move the Court to adopt the Report and  
15 Recommendations, and DAPs likewise will not lodge with the Court objections to the Report and  
16 Recommendations with respect to SEC and SEAI.

17       **IT IS SO STIPULATED.**  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 Dated: June 5, 2013

O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP

2 By: /s/ Ian Simmons

3 IAN SIMMONS (*pro hac vice*)

4 Email: isimmons@omm.com

BENJAMIN G. BRADSHAW (SBN 189925)

5 Email: bbradshaw@omm.com

KEVIN D. FEDER (SBN 252347)

6 Email: kfeder@omm.com

**O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP**

1625 Eye Street, NW

7 Washington, DC 20006

8 Telephone: (202) 383-5300

Facsimile: (202) 383-5414

9 *Attorneys for Defendants Samsung*  
10 *Electronics Co., Ltd. and Samsung*  
11 *Electronics America, Inc.*

12 Dated: June 5, 2013

BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP

13 By: /s/ Philip J. Iovieno

PHILIP J. IOVIENO

14 Email: piovieno@bsfllp.com

ANNE M. NARDACCI

15 Email: anardacci@bsfllp.com

**BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP**

10 North Pearl Street, 4th Floor

16 Albany, NY 12207

17 Telephone: (518) 434-0600

Facsimile: (518) 434-0665

18 WILLIAM A. ISAACSON

Email: wisaacson@bsfllp.com

JENNIFER MILICI

19 Email: jmilici@bsfllp.com

**BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP**

20 5301 Wisconsin Ave. NW, Suite 800

21 Washington, D.C. 20015

22 Telephone: (202) 237-2727

Facsimile: (202) 237-6131

23 STUART SINGER

Email: ssinger@bsfllp.com

**BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP**

24 401 East Las Olas Blvd., Suite 1200

25 Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301

26 Telephone: (954) 356-0011

Facsimile: (954) 356-0022

27 *Liaison Counsel for Direct Action*  
28 *Plaintiffs and Attorneys for Plaintiffs*  
*Electrograph Systems, Inc., Electrograph*

Technologies, Corp., Office Depot, Inc.,  
Compucom Systems, Inc., Interbond  
Corporation of America, P.C. Richard &  
Son Long Island Corporation, Marta  
Cooperative of America, Inc., ABC  
Appliance, Inc., Schultze Agency Services  
LLC on behalf of Tweeter Opco, LLC and  
Tweeter Newco, LLC, Tech Data  
Corporation, and Tech Data Product  
Management, Inc.

PERKINS COIE LLP

By: /s/ David J. Burman  
DAVID J. BURMAN (*pro hac vice*)  
Email: DBurman@perkinscoie.com  
CORI G. MOORE (*pro hac vice*)  
Email: CGMoore@perkinscoie.com  
ERIC J. WEISS (*pro hac vice*)  
Email: EWeiss@perkinscoie.com  
NICHOLAS H. HESTERBERG (*pro hac vice*)  
Email: NHesterberg@perkinscoie.com  
**PERKINS COIE LLP**  
1201 Third Avenue, Suite 4900  
Seattle, WA 98101-3099  
Telephone: 206.359.8000  
Facsimile: 206.359.9000

JOREN BASS (Bar No. 208143)  
Email: JBass@perkinscoie.com  
**PERKINS COIE LLP**  
Four Embarcadero Center, Suite 2400  
San Francisco, CA 94111-4131  
Telephone: 415.344.7120  
Facsimile: 415.344.7320

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Costco Wholesale  
Corporation*

ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P.

By: /s/ Roman M. Silberfeld  
ROMAN M. SILBERFELD (SBN 62783)  
Email: RMSilberfeld@rkmc.com  
DAVID MARTINEZ (SBN 193183)  
Email: DMartinez@rkmc.com  
**ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P.]**  
2049 Century Park East, Suite 3400  
Los Angeles, CA 90067-3208  
Telephone: (310) 552-0130  
Facsimile: (310) 229-5800

*Attorneys For Plaintiffs Best Buy Co., Inc, Best*

*Buy Purchasing LLC, Best Buy Enterprise Services, Inc., Best Buy Stores, L.P., Bestbuy.com, L.L.C., and Magnolia Hi-Fi, LLC*

SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.

By: /s/ Kenneth S. Marks  
H. LEE GODFREY  
Email: lgodfrey@sumangodfrey.com  
KENNETH S. MARKS  
Email: kmarks@sumangodfrey.com  
JONATHAN J. ROSS  
Email: jross@sumangodfrey.com  
JOHNNY W. CARTER  
Email: jcarter@sumangodfrey.com  
DAVID M. PETERSON  
Email: dpeterson@sumangodfrey.com  
**SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.**  
1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 5100  
Houston, Texas 77002  
Telephone: (713) 651-9366  
Facsimile: (713) 654-6666

PARKER C. FOLSE III  
Email: pfolse@sumangodfrey.com  
RACHEL S. BLACK  
Email: rblack@sumangodfrey.com  
JORDAN CONNORS  
Email: jconnors@sumangodfrey.com  
**SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.**  
1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3800  
Seattle, Washington 98101-3000  
Telephone: (206) 516-3880  
Facsimile: (206) 516-3883

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Alfred H. Siegel, as Trustee of the Circuit City Stores, Inc. Liquidating Trust*

CROWELL & MORING LLP

By: /s/ Jason C. Murray  
JASON C. MURRAY (CA Bar No. 169806)  
Email: jmurray@crowell.com  
**CROWELL & MORING LLP**  
515 South Flower St., 40th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Telephone: (213) 443-5582  
Facsimile: (213) 622-2690

JEROME A. MURPHY (*pro hac vice*)  
E-mail: jmurphy@crowell.com  
ASTOR H.L. HEAVEN (*pro hac vice*)

Email: aheaven@crowell.com  
**CROWELL & MORING LLP**  
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Telephone: (202) 624-2500  
Facsimile: (202) 628-5116

*Counsel for Target Corp.*

KENNY NACHWALTER, P.A.

By: /s/ Richard Alan Arnold  
RICHARD ALAN ARNOLD  
Email: rarnold@knpa.com  
WILLIAM J. BLECHMAN  
Email: wblechman@knpa.com  
KEVIN J. MURRAY  
Email: kmurray@knpa.com  
**KENNY NACHWALTER, P.A.**  
201 S. Biscayne Blvd., Suite 1100  
Miami, FL 33131  
Tel: (305) 373-1000  
Fax: (305) 372-1861

*Counsel for Plaintiff Sears, Roebuck and Co.  
and Kmart Corp.*

LINDQUIST & VENNUM P.L.L.P.

By: /s/ Jessica L. Meyer  
Jessica L. Meyer (SBN: 249064)  
Email: jmeyer@lindquist.com  
James M. Lockhart (*pro hac vice*)  
Email: jlockhart@lindquist.com  
James P. McCarthy (*pro hac vice*)  
Email: jmccarthy@lindquist.com  
Kelly G. Laudon (*pro hac vice*)  
Email: klaudon@lindquist.com  
**LINDQUIST & VENNUM P.L.L.P.**  
4200 IDS Center  
80 South Eighth Street  
Minneapolis, MN 55402  
Telephone: (612) 371-3211  
Facsimile: (612) 371-3207

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs John R. Stoeber, as  
Chapter 7 Trustee for PBE Consumer  
Electronics, LLC and Related Entities; and  
Douglas A. Kelley, as Chapter 11 Trustee for  
Petters Company, Inc. and Related Entities, and  
as Receiver for Petters Company, LLC and  
Related Entities*

1           **Pursuant to Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), the filer attests that concurrence in the filing of this**  
2 **document has been obtained from the signatories.**

3  
4 **PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

5 Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Hon. Samuel Conti  
United States District Judge